



Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

Thursday, March 11, 2010

LEGAL ACTION REPORT

1. Call to Order/Roll Call: 1:04 p.m.

Commissioners: Teresita Majewski (Chair), Kathy Nabours, Demion Clinco, Bill Mackey, Sharon Chadwick, Patsy Waterfall, Gal Witmer

Staff: Frank S. Podgorski, Michael Taku, Jonathan Mabry, Irene Ogata, Aline Torres

2. Courtesy Review:

City of Tucson Information Technology Building-Removal/Planting of Trees; 48 West Paseo Redondo (Revised Plan)

Presentation by Irene Ogata, City of Tucson, Office of Conservation & Community Development, on a revised plan for the location of trees at the Information & Technology Building. At the October 22, 2009 meeting, the plans review subcommittee recommended the tamarisk trees determined to be invasive be replaced with new tamarisk trees along with other deciduous trees as shown on the submitted site plan. Ms. Ogata stated that replacement tamarisk trees were unavailable for sale citing different tree nursery sources throughout Arizona and California. Ken Scoville, local historian, spoke about the availability of tamarisk trees from the Boyce-Thompson arboretum and the area north of Speedway Boulevard along the Santa Cruz linear park that the city could transplant to this site. Commissioner Chadwick stated that native velvet mesquites should be planted in favor of hybrid mesquites. Commissioner Clinco stated the historic landscape at this site is being dishonored by not replanting new tamarisk. Commissioner Nabours also had concerns about hybrid mesquites due to their undeveloped root structure related to their fast growing cycles. A suggestion by Mr. Scoville to plant California Pepper trees in place of the tamarisk trees was summarily rejected by Commissioner Waterfall due to their high water usage.

Motion by Commissioner Waterfall to recommend approval of the revised plan including the Palo Brea (Palo Brea) in the front of the IT Building (east elevation), Prosopis velutina 'Leroy' (Leroy Mesquite) on the side (south elevation) and Chilopsis linearis 'Warren Jones' (Warren Jones Desert Willow) along the side towards the rear of the building (south elevation).

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed 5-1. Chair Majewski did not vote.

3. Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone:

RND 10-02 An Congress-Rehabilitation; 278 East Congress Street (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone) (National Register Eligible)

Presentation by Sonya Sotinsky, FORS Architecture, on the rehabilitation of two combined storefront buildings located on the south side of East Congress Street between North Stone Avenue/North 5th Avenue. These buildings were constructed in 1911. The proposal is to clean the brick face elevations (north and east) by removing the existing stucco, keep the horizontal header, retain the parapet, add a rooftop deck for dining, add a front canopy entryway, maintain the existing storefront entryways, install a steel sash window system and add sliding glass doors. The height of the building will remain unchanged. This proposal respects the Secretary of the Interior Standards of distinguishing between the existing and new elements for rehabilitation. All openings on the 5th Avenue elevation will remain unchanged. An addition to the rear of the building (south elevation) will enable rooftop deck access via elevator. A rear outdoor patio dining area is also proposed. A total of nine (9) deciduous trees will be planted along the 5th Avenue side of the building.

Commissioner Mackey addressed the proposed steel railings along the front street elevation (to satisfy liquor law requirements), the proposed awning on the front elevation and a steel base to be installed on the storefronts after the existing black tile is removed. Commissioner Clinco questioned the proposed removal of the black tile base. Ms. Sotinsky believes the storefronts should have glass extending to the ground adjacent to the pedestrian sidewalk area to maintain a rhythm along the front elevation. She stated research indicates the original building did not have base tile on the storefronts. Commissioner Chadwick stated there was not enough evidence to suggest the existing base tile is not historic in character to the existing storefronts. Commissioner Mackey requested additional research on the base tile for the storefronts and a cross section of the steel sash window system. He emphasized the importance of proportions on this National Register eligible building and the interrelationship amongst the proposed roof deck, cantilever element, base tile on the front elevation, awning and the glass windows/doors.

Ms. Sotinsky agreed to return to the subcommittee with details on the cantilever element, front railings, awning, roof deck and all the storefront details.

RND 10-03 Carriage House-Rehabilitation; 118 South 5th Avenue (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone) (National Register Eligible)

Proposal by Bill Mackey (excused himself from the subcommittee discussion and voting on the proposal) and Elizabeth Farkas, both with Rob Paulus Architects, on the rehabilitation of a National Register eligible building proposed as a change of use from commercial to residential/office use. Eight (8) residential units are proposed with an office area component. Located behind the historic Julian Drew Building on East Broadway Boulevard, the east

elevation along South 5th Avenue will have a storefront window replacing the existing steel roll-up door. The Arizona Avenue façade (west elevation) has the most historic integrity and will remain. The north elevation will have new windows and doors installed. The east elevation will be repainted along with all window and door trim. Ms. Farkas presented paint swatches of neutral grey/salmon for existing painted surfaces and trim with exposed brick remaining. No signs are proposed and the mechanical for the building will be located on the roof not visible from the public right-of way.

In summary, no changes are proposed for the west elevation of the building, the north elevation will have two wall openings (windows) changed to doorways for building access and the east elevation will have the roll-up door replaced with a window storefront.

Motion by Patsy Waterfall to recommend approval of this rehabilitation as proposed.

Seconded by Demion Clinco.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Chair Majewski and Commissioner Mackey did not vote.

.....

4. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:
 - a. Minor Reviews: HPZ 10-14 Carroll-Fence/Gate; 433 North Main Avenue (El Presidio Historic Preservation Zone)
 - b. Appeals: No appeals at this time.
 - c. Zoning Violations: Zoning violations in historic preservation zones are reported to the Code Enforcement section of Community Services at 792-CITY and a city inspector is assigned to investigate the complaint. If a zoning violation is confirmed, the property owner is given the opportunity to abate the violatin by successfully completing the historic review/approval process in accordance with Sec. 2.8.8. of the City of Tucson Land Use Code.
 - d. Historic Preservation Zone Development Standards: No report at this time.
5. Call to the Audience: No one to speak.
6. Meeting adjourned at 2:55 p.m.